

NIST PRIVACY WORKFORCE PUBLIC WORKING GROUP (PWWG)

Co-Chair: Dylan Gilbert, NIST Privacy Policy Advisor

MONTHLY MEETING MINUTES

Wednesday, June 14, 2023

1:00 P.M. ET – 2:00 P.M. ET

I. INTRODUCTION

The 24th meeting of the National Institute of Standards and Technology (NIST) Privacy Workforce Public Working Group (PWWG) convened on Wednesday, June 14th from 1:00 P.M. - 2:00 P.M. ET virtually via Microsoft Teams. There were 53 attendees.

The PWWG provides a forum for participants from the public, including private industry, the public sector, academia, and civil society, to create the content of the NIST Privacy Workforce Taxonomy. The PWWG is tasked with creating Task, Knowledge, and Skill (TKS) Statements aligned with the [NIST Privacy Framework](#) and the National Initiative for Cybersecurity Education (NICE) [Workforce Framework for Cybersecurity](#).

PWWG Co-Chair, Dylan Gilbert, welcomed attendees and Project Teams Co-Leads and thanked them for their participation. Doug Forman, PWWG Co-Chair, was also in attendance.

II. PWWG UPDATE

A. New Member Orientation

During last month's PWWG meeting, members were asked whether they want a new member orientation. The answer was a resounding yes. A live orientation will be held on Thursday, June 15th from 11:00am - 12:00pm ET. If anyone did not receive an invite, please email pwwg@nist.gov. Another live session may be held when the next round of Project Teams starts in late August/early September.

Dylan announced that the NIST PWWG Team will record an orientation video, which PWWG members will be able to watch on-demand. The recording should take place within the next month. Once officially approved, the video will be hosted on the PWWG website. There are older TKS development video tutorials, which are housed in an obscure location on the NIST Privacy website. Additionally, one of the videos is out of date. If anyone is interested in keeping the old tutorials when the new video is available, please send an email to pwwg@nist.gov.

B. Sprint Team Update

Dylan acknowledged that members are likely wondering what happened to the Sprint Team? The Sprint Team was supposed to take the TKS Statements from the NICE Framework that are mapped to the NIST Cybersecurity Framework (CSF) and map those to the Protect-P Function in the NIST Privacy Framework. However, the NIST Cybersecurity Framework is undergoing an update to CSF 2.0. The NICE team is now readjusting their timeline to have their TKS Statement updates mirror the CSF update timeline, which will be running into next year.

The Sprint Team is on hold until everything is completed. Hopefully sometime early next year, after the CSF has been fully updated and the NICE team has updated their TKS Statements, work can begin on aligning those with the NIST Privacy Framework.

C. New TKS Statements

Dylan thanked the NIST team for compiling the material in time for the call. There is a lot going on. Between Project Teams 3, 4 and 5, there are hundreds of Statements. Project Team 3 has approximately 275 new Statements. Project Team 4 has approximately 100 new Statements. Project Team 6 has approximately 75. A big

thanks to everyone who worked on those teams. There are a couple of loose ends that need to be tied up. As of today, there are 200 Task Statements, 231 Knowledge Statements and 198 Skill Statements that are complete. There is still a lot of work to do. Bottom line, this is a very robust resource collectively being put together. All the work being done is and will be valuable to our profession.

Dylan informed the group that they were being shown two NIST PWWG Compilation Documents. One is an inventory document, and one is a mapping document. The entire Identify-P Function is complete within the compilation documents. Within the Risk Assessment Category, there is still one Subcategory to finish up. That work is being done in partnership with the AI team at NIST. The hope is to have that work finished by August so it can be added to the compilation document. All the Inventory and Mapping, Business Environment, Risk Assessment, Data Processing Ecosystem, and Risk Management areas are finished in these documents. The Govern Policies, Processes and Procedures (GV.PO-P) from Project Team 3 is in there as well. Policies, Processes and Procedures for our Communicate-P and Control-P Functions will be finished next month. Dylan met with the Project Team 3 Co-Leads earlier today to finish up those Statements. They will go in the document within the next few weeks.

The Statements will change. They will certainly change later when they are opened to public comment. Even prior to public comment, they will continuously be cleaned up and changed when authoring issues arise. The NIST PWWG Team will also need to conduct a conformity exercise. There are slight variations on similar types of Knowledge and Skill Statements because each Project Team is different. All the TKS Statements will need to be made uniform and standardized. The team will begin to conduct conformity work this summer. The conformity work will likely create small changes within the document.

The team is also considering a front matter baseline. There will be a baseline level of Knowledge and Skills that will be necessary to use the NIST Privacy Framework and to use this resource. There have been a lot of conversations at the Co-Chair level about this. It is a tricky line drawing exercise about what goes in, what stays out, and what format should this information be presented in? As we get more clarity around this front matter baseline some stuff may come out of the compilation documents because they are deemed baseline level. Conversely, some things may get put in. There will be slight changes to the approach because there is a norm that has developed within the group on how Statements are approached. We have come to a place where teams are avoiding Knowledge Statements phrased like, 'Knowledge of how...'. That phrasing was deemed a clear signal that the Knowledge Statement should be a Skill Statement. That informal rule was not in place during the earlier Project Teams. As part of the conformity exercise, the team will go back and get that information cleaned up.

Dylan read a participant question: "How active do you think the public will be once this is opened up for comment?" There is no way to predict, but there is always activity. The public is aware about what is going on. Dylan would not be surprised if it is very active. The team is grateful for everyone putting in the hard work.

Signaling dependencies is a common topic now and will continue to be in the future. The team must decide whether to bring stuff in from other Subcategories, and list that Task out. It has been done for one of the Project Teams. It may be a code of signals that reference other areas in which a person may want to look. A similar exercise was done with NIST Special Publication 853-Rev 5. As you are thinking through what we are doing, feel free to share your ideas.

There is a '[New Business Suggestion form](#)' on the PWWG website where anyone can drop a note. The form can be used to submit suggestions for open discussion topics at the NIST Privacy Workforce Public Working Group (PWWG) monthly meeting. If anyone has any suggestions about how to handle the dependencies, please leave a note. People should not be shy about solving this problem.

Dylan read a member question, "Where do these compilation documents sit?" They are currently housed in the 'Reference Documents' folder on the [PWWG Google drive](#). There is an outdated compilation document in the folder. Currently in the process of performing 508 compliance checks. The team will provide members an update by middle of next week on where everything stands.

Dylan provided a live view of the compilation documents. The team wants to give members a sense of what they look like and explain the point of the documents. There is a 'Compilation Inventory'. It compiles all the Tasks, Knowledge, and Skill Statements for the entire NIST Privacy Framework in alphabetical order. It is a giant list. The point of it is to provide a resource for maximum flexibility. The thinking is that once the inventory is complete, an organization can use it to build stuff. It provides a list from which a company can select a particular bundle specific to their organization. This is the maximally flexible way to use this information. There is no guidance. It will continue to grow as a document as the work is carried on.

There is also the Compilation Mapping Document. This is where Task, Knowledge and Skill Statements are specifically mapped to each Subcategory within the NIST Privacy Framework. It will have additional information once completed. There is a lot of variety on what would go in and what would go out. It was decided to make it alphabetical. This method creates some challenges. There is no chronology that is baked into these kinds of mapping exercises. Will that cause a problem given the natural tendencies to read things chronologically? A similar issue happened with the NIST Privacy Framework. This is not intended to apply chronologically. There may be a necessity to signal that better.

Another issue is that NIST does not currently provide any signaling of how various Knowledge or Skill Statements may map to various Tasks. A lot of the project teams have built out their TKS Statements in that way. They look at a Task and then ask what Knowledge or Skill Statements are aligned with it? The alignment the teams have done will likely get lost in this mapping exercise. A decision will need to be made on whether to do those kinds of signals. A lot of additional information will be necessary to put into this. However, this may cause more confusion than help. Dylan is asking members to ask themselves how they would use the information? What is the best way to provide this information that would be helpful and provide good guidance? The key is to avoid information filled with too many symbols. Symbols can become overwhelming and add unnecessary confusion. For now, there is a simple mapping that provides Tasks, Knowledge, and Skills. It provides enough next level guidance that an organization can utilize and build upon. The work will continue in both the near and far term.

III. Project Team Updates

Dylan introduced the new class of Project Team Leads.

A. Project Team 6 (PT6)

- PT6 has two Co-Leads: Dana Garbo, Chief Privacy Officer, Medline Industries and James Koons, Founding Partner, Data Privacy & Security Advisors
- Dana Garbo introduced herself. She is very happy to Co-Lead the team. Dana, a lawyer, has worked within Healthcare and Privacy for over twenty years. It is impossible to chase pure compliance with law, especially with the flood of emerging technology. It is not sustainable. Dana appreciates the fact that the information is not chronological. If anyone wants to join PT6 please do. One of Dana's co-workers came up with a name for their Project Team, 'Gorillas on the NIST'.
- Dylan reviewed the PT6 work assignment.
 - Risk Management Strategy (GV.RM-P): The organization's priorities, constraints, risk tolerances, and assumptions are established and used to support operational risk decisions.
 - There are three Subcategories under the GV.RM-P Category.
- PT6 is about a week behind in terms of scheduling. Their first meeting will likely take place in two weeks.
- To join PT6, send an email to: PrivacyWorkforcePT6+subscribe@list.nist.gov

B. Project Team 7 (PT7)

- Project Team 7 Leads, Dr. Elif Kiesow Cortez, Research Fellow, Stanford Law School and Ivy Orecchio, Cybersecurity and Privacy Services Manager, Venable LLP were on the call. Another PT7 team Lead, Jacqueline Crawley, VP of Governance, ISACA Atlanta, was unable to attend the meeting.
- Dr. Elif Kiesow Cortez introduced herself to the group. Much of her life has been focused on providing Awareness Trainings but she has also worked at the executive level. They are a great group who will be looking at not only awareness and training needs for the usual suspects, but they will also focus on how this an important issue for those at the Senior Executive Level.
- Ivy Orecchio introduced herself to the group. She has worked for Federal, State and Local government offices as well as the private sector. She is excited to bring her perspective on training and awareness into the group as well as hearing about everyone's unique experiences in the field.
- Dylan reviewed the PT7 work assignment.
 - Risk Management Strategy (GV.RM-P): The organization's priorities, constraints, risk tolerances, and assumptions are established and used to support operational risk decisions.
 - There are three Subcategories under this Category.
- PT7's first meeting will be on Wednesday, June 21st at 1:00pm ET.
- To join PT7, send an email to: PrivacyWorkforcePT7+subscribe@list.nist.gov

C. Project Team 8 (PT8)

- Project Team 8 Co-Leads, Abhinav (Abby) Palia, Sr. Research Scientist, AWS and Nikita Samarin, Digital Safety and Privacy Researcher, UC Berkeley were on the call. Co-Lead, Ridwan Badmus, Legal Associate & CTO, Aguntoye LP, was unable to join.
- Nikita Samarin introduced himself. Nikita is very excited to be a part of the team. Looking forward to developing the TKS Statements.
- Abby Palia introduced himself to the working group. Abby is happy to bring his experience to work with his great Co-Leads. It is a wonderful opportunity for everyone to grow and build together.
- Dylan reviewed the PT8 work assignment.
 - Data Processing Management (CT.DM-P): Data are managed consistent with the organization's risk strategy to protect individuals' privacy, increase manageability, and enable the implementation of privacy principles (e.g., individual participation, data quality, data minimization).
 - There are ten Subcategories under this category. This is where the policy requirements need to be implemented on the technical level.
- The PT8's first meeting will be on Tuesday, June 20th at 12:00pm ET.
- To join PT8, send an email to: PrivacyWorkforcePT8+subscribe@list.nist.gov.

IV. Q & A

- Q: A member asked if it was still the plan for the Project Team Leads to develop initial TKS Statements which would then be brought to the larger audience?

- A: Dylan noted that it is still the plan, and that the pre-population work is underway. Dylan noted that the early Subcategories within these teams will be much more fleshed out and complete. Further along in the workbooks, information will look less developed. They will iteratively be worked on at the Team Co-Lead and Co-Chair level, ensuring the work of one Subcategory is complete before moving onto another.

V. NEXT STEPS & UPCOMING MEETINGS

A. NEXT STEPS

Join a project team! The mailing lists are now live. Sign up for any team or all of teams! The team Leads will soon send out a welcome note via the Google Group mailing list.

- PT6 (GV.RM-P): PrivacyWorkforcePT6+subscribe@list.nist.gov
- PT7 (GV.AT-P): PrivacyWorkforcePT7+subscribe@list.nist.gov
- PT8 (CT.DM-P): PrivacyWorkforcePT8+subscribe@list.nist.gov

B. UPCOMING MEETINGS

The upcoming meetings of the NIST PWWG and its Project Teams are noted below. For further information, including updated meeting schedules, meeting minutes, agendas, and slide deck please visit the [PWWG web page](#).

PWWG Team Orientation

- Thursday, June 15, 2023 | 11:00am-12:00pm ET

Project Team 6 (PT6)

- First Meeting: TBD

Project Team 7 (PT7)

- First Meeting: Wednesday, June 21, 2023, | 1:00pm – 2:00pm ET

Project Team 8 (PT8)

- First Meeting: Tuesday, June 20, 2023 | 12:00pm – 1:00pm ET

NIST Privacy Workforce Public Working Group

- Wednesday, July 12, 2023 | 1:00pm – 2:00pm ET

C. NEW BUSINESS OPEN TOPICS

New Business Open Discussion Topics Drop Box is available on the [NIST Privacy Workforce Working Group](#) webpage. If you are interested in presenting a business topic during a PWWG Monthly Meeting, please visit the webpage noted above.

D. TROUBLESHOOTING

If you have any technical issues with meeting invitations, mailing lists, and/or accessing the Google Drives,

please email NIST PWWG Support at PWWG@nist.gov.

E. JOIN MAILING LIST

To join one of the Project Teams you must subscribe to its associated mailing list. All mailing lists are moderated. Please be reminded to adhere to the Mailing List Rules that can be found on the [NIST Privacy Workforce Working Group](#) website.

- PWWG: PrivacyWorkforceWG+subscribe@list.nist.gov
- PT6 (GV.RM-P): PrivacyWorkforcePT6+subscribe@list.nist.gov
- PT7 (GV.AT-P): PrivacyWorkforcePT7+subscribe@list.nist.gov
- PT8 (CT.DM-P): PrivacyWorkforcePT8+subscribe@list.nist.gov

RESOURCES:

E-mail addresses for members to join/subscribe: Privacy Workforce Working Group (PWWG):
PrivacyWorkforceWG+subscribe@list.nist.gov

Project Team 6 (PT6): PrivacyWorkforcePT6+subscribe@list.nist.gov

Project Team 7 (PT7): PrivacyWorkforcePT7+subscribe@list.nist.gov

Project Team 8 (PT8): PrivacyWorkforcePT8+subscribe@list.nist.gov

PWWG Support: PWWG@nist.gov