

**Editor's Proposed Disposition of Comments on ANSI/NIST-ITL 1-2011 Supplement 4 for Forensic Voice**

Date: 01-27-2013	Document: <b>Version 1.2</b>
------------------	------------------------------

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB <sup>1</sup>	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Editor's Proposed Disposition on each comment submitted
Nob 1	Scope of the Type-11 Record	Page 9, lines 347-356	ge	Text beginning with "Although" provides good guidance but would be better included in a Best Practices document		Noted
SJS U/1	Record Type-11: Voice Record	Line 460	T	Reinstate removed sentences. Although they apply at the transaction level, nothing in the current document makes these words incorrect. It is clarifying to point out at the top of the document that the Type-1 record can contain multiple speakers and does not itself define the transaction.	Add "A single ANSI/NIST-ITL transaction might contain multiple voice recordings, each as a separate Type-11 record within the transaction. Although the transaction pertains to a single person, the individual voice recordings in each of the Type-11 records required for the transaction may contain the speech of multiple speakers".	DISCUSS <b>DEFER FOR LATER</b>
Nob 2	Table 1, Field 11.003 - VRSO-STC	Page 13	ed	The Value Constraints P and I are each listed twice	Change contents of Value Constraints to STC = U, P, I, G, or O	<b>ACCEPT</b>
Nob 11	Table 1	Page 14	Te	In Field 11.006, the mnemonic for Analog to Digital conversion is listed as A2D. Don't think mnemonics should contain numbers.	Change A2D to ATD or something similar without numbers.	<b>REJECT</b> Mnemonics already include numbers in some instances.
Nob 10	Table 1	Page 15	te	In Field 11.010, RSU is described as being a text field, but the Character type is listed as AS instead of U.	Change character type to U.	<b>ACCEPT</b>
Nob 3	Table 1, Field 11.038-SCH-ACS	Page 25	ge	Need to differentiate table references that are to other than the Voice Supplement document	Note that Table 88 refers to ANSI/NIST-ITL 1-2011 and not the Voice Supplement. This needs to be done for references to Table 88 throughout the rest of the Voice Supplement.	THE SAME FORMAT AS THE DENTAL SUPPLEMENT i.e. SUPPLEMENT TABLE xx for internal ones and without the word Supplement means that it is in the original part

Please enter the date that you submit the comment in the Date box.

1 **MB** = Member identifier -- use something like NIST or ABC to designate your group

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

**NOTE** Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Add Rows as needed.

**Editor's Proposed Disposition of Comments on ANSI/NIST-ITL 1-2011 Supplement 4 for Forensic Voice**

Date: 01-27-2013	Document: <b>Version 1.2</b>
------------------	------------------------------

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB <sup>1</sup>	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Editor's Proposed Disposition on each comment submitted
						of the Standard. This sentence will be placed at the beginning of the document.
Nob 4	Field 11.002	Page 27, line 494	ed	Period missing at end of sentence.	Add period to end of sentence,	<b>ACCEPT</b>
DoD BS WG 26	Field 11.005: Role of Voice Recording	Line 835		Decompose Field Id 11.005 into its core root attributes.	<p>Rename field to <b>Voice Recording Content Descriptor</b>; Delete/remove Table V-3 Role of Voice Recording. New description of Field 11.005 <b>Voice Recording Descriptor</b> should be as follows:</p> <p>This field shall describe the content of the voice recording. It consists of 3 information items:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ The first information item (<b>subject known indicator /SKI</b>) is a binary indicator and is mandatory if this field is used. It indicates if the voice recording sample was obtained from a known subject. 0 indicates subject was unknown; 1 indicates subject was known.</li> <li>○ The second information item (<b>speaker plurality code/SPC</b>) indicates plurality of speakers represented on voice recording.</li> </ul>	<p><b>PARTIAL ACCEPT. OPTIONAL Field:</b> If any items are mandatory, the designators "Assigned voice" "Questioned voice" "Other" must be available.</p> <p>Roles (voice descriptor) depend upon TOT and TOT depends upon Exchange Agreements (Implementation Profiles)</p> <p><b>TOT is mandatory in Record Type-1</b> There can be consistency checks based upon the TOT value.</p> <p><b>SINGLE/MULTIPLE SPEAKER SHOULD BE A SEPARATE</b></p>

Please enter the date that you submit the comment in the Date box.

1 **MB** = Member identifier -- use something like NIST or ABC to designate your group

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

**NOTE** Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Add Rows as needed.

**Editor's Proposed Disposition of Comments on ANSI/NIST-ITL 1-2011  
Supplement 4 for Forensic Voice**

Date: 01-27-2013	Document: <b>Version 1.2</b>
------------------	------------------------------

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB <sup>1</sup>	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com- ment <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Editor's Proposed Disposition on each comment submitted
					<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ M = multiple speakers</li> <li>○ S = single speaker</li> <li>○ The third information item (<b>voice descriptor code/VDC</b>) describes the role of the voice recording sample within the transaction. When speaker plurality code indicates a single speaker, this field differentiates if voice is subject or interlocutor. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ S = Subject</li> <li>○ I = Interlocutor</li> </ul> </li> <li>○ When speaker plurality code indicates multiple speakers, this field describes if voice sample includes or excludes the subject of the transaction. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ N = Includes</li> <li>○ X = Excludes</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<b>OPTIONAL FIELD.</b> Reject use of third and fourth items
MIT /1	Field 11.011	679	T	Replace the entire section with this contribution.	This is an optional field ( <b>container format/CFT</b> ) that gives information about the container format, if any, which encapsulates the audio data of the electronic file used to carry the voice data in the digital recording. This field is not used if the voice recording is stored on a physical media object as an analog signal. If present, this field overrides the <b>CDC</b> Field 11.012. This field does	<b>ACCEPT</b>

Please enter the date that you submit the comment in the Date box.

1 **MB** = Member identifier -- use something like NIST or ABC to designate your group

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

**NOTE** Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Add Rows as needed.

**Editor's Proposed Disposition of Comments on ANSI/NIST-ITL 1-2011  
Supplement 4 for Forensic Voice**

Date: 01-27-2013	Document: <b>Version 1.2</b>
------------------	------------------------------

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)						
MB <sup>1</sup>	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com- ment <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Editor's Proposed Disposition on each comment submitted						
					<p>not accommodate multiple Container Formats in a single Type-11 record. The Container Format shall be entered as the appropriate integer code from Table 3 below.</p> <p>Container files incorporate audio samples and specifications to properly decode the audio, such as the codec, and its parameters, e.g., number of channels, sample rate, bit/byte depth, and big/little endian. More generally, the container formats can specify a codec, or simply encapsulate one or more audio channels as Linear PCM.</p> <p>The well-known Wave container specification has fields such as chunk ID, chunk size, audio format (codec), sampling rate, number of channels, space for extra parameters (for the codec or other uses).</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Table 3 Table of Audio Visual Container Types</p> <table border="1" style="margin-left: auto; margin-right: auto;"> <thead> <tr> <th>Container Type</th> <th>Windows Extension(s)</th> <th>Attribute Code</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td> </td> <td> </td> <td> </td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Container Type	Windows Extension(s)	Attribute Code				
Container Type	Windows Extension(s)	Attribute Code										

Please enter the date that you submit the comment in the Date box.

1 **MB** = Member identifier -- use something like NIST or ABC to designate your group

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

**NOTE** Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Add Rows as needed.

**Editor's Proposed Disposition of Comments on ANSI/NIST-ITL 1-2011  
Supplement 4 for Forensic Voice**

Date: 01-27-2013	Document: <b>Version 1.2</b>
------------------	------------------------------

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)																														
MB <sup>1</sup>	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com- ment <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Editor's Proposed Disposition on each comment submitted																														
					<table border="1"> <tr> <td>RAW format (no Container)</td> <td></td> <td>0</td> </tr> <tr> <td>WAV (RIFF audio)</td> <td>.wav</td> <td>1</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3GP and 3G2 mobile video</td> <td>.3gp .3g2</td> <td>1</td> </tr> <tr> <td>AIFF</td> <td>.aiff .aif</td> <td>1</td> </tr> <tr> <td>MP3 (MPEG-1, Layer 3 audio)</td> <td>.mp3</td> <td>1</td> </tr> <tr> <td>QuickTime (Apple VBR-audio/video/image)</td> <td>.mov .qt</td> <td>1</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Video for Windows</td> <td>.avi</td> <td>1</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Vorbis (OGG audio)</td> <td>.ogg</td> <td>1</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Windows Media</td> <td>.wmv .wma .asf .asx</td> <td>1</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Other</td> <td></td> <td>2</td> </tr> </table> <p>All the audio characteristics required to properly interpret RAW format data must be provided elsewhere, so if RAW is specified, then Field 11.012 is mandatory since the codec type and its parameters (SRT, BIT, EDN, PNT, and CHC) must be specified for retrieval of the audio.</p> <p>A Container Type of Other (<b>CFT=2</b>) indicates that the Container is not given in Table 3 and is</p>	RAW format (no Container)		0	WAV (RIFF audio)	.wav	1	3GP and 3G2 mobile video	.3gp .3g2	1	AIFF	.aiff .aif	1	MP3 (MPEG-1, Layer 3 audio)	.mp3	1	QuickTime (Apple VBR-audio/video/image)	.mov .qt	1	Video for Windows	.avi	1	Vorbis (OGG audio)	.ogg	1	Windows Media	.wmv .wma .asf .asx	1	Other		2	
RAW format (no Container)		0																																		
WAV (RIFF audio)	.wav	1																																		
3GP and 3G2 mobile video	.3gp .3g2	1																																		
AIFF	.aiff .aif	1																																		
MP3 (MPEG-1, Layer 3 audio)	.mp3	1																																		
QuickTime (Apple VBR-audio/video/image)	.mov .qt	1																																		
Video for Windows	.avi	1																																		
Vorbis (OGG audio)	.ogg	1																																		
Windows Media	.wmv .wma .asf .asx	1																																		
Other		2																																		

Please enter the date that you submit the comment in the Date box.

1 **MB** = Member identifier -- use something like NIST or ABC to designate your group

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

**NOTE** Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Add Rows as needed.

**Editor's Proposed Disposition of Comments on ANSI/NIST-ITL 1-2011  
Supplement 4 for Forensic Voice**

Date: 01-27-2013	Document: <b>Version 1.2</b>
------------------	------------------------------

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB <sup>1</sup>	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com- ment <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Editor's Proposed Disposition on each comment submitted
					specified externally to the Type-11 Standard. Containers not specified in Table 3 are optional, are not guaranteed to exist in a given implementation of the standard, and should be used with caution. Optional Containers are specified in Table 3-External, as published in the document <i>External Container Formats</i> , available: <a href="http://xyx.gov">http://xyx.gov</a> .	
MIT /2	Field 11.012	708	T	Replace the section with the following:	<p>This is an optional field that gives information about the codec used to encode the voice and audio data in the digital recording. This field is not used if the voice recording is stored on a physical media object as an analog signal. This field is only used if the digital audio file lacks a Container. Information in Field 11.011 (<b>Container Type/CFT</b>) overrides this Field if both are present. The following information types can be specified.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ <b>Codec type code (CDT):</b> is mandatory if this information item is used and indicates the single codec type used for all audio segments in the record. This format does not accommodate multiple codec types within a single record. It shall be a numeric entry selected from the Attribute Code column of <b>Table 4</b>. If</li> </ul>	ACCEPT

Please enter the date that you submit the comment in the Date box.

1 **MB** = Member identifier -- use something like NIST or ABC to designate your group

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

**NOTE** Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Add Rows as needed.

**Editor's Proposed Disposition of Comments on ANSI/NIST-ITL 1-2011 Supplement 4 for Forensic Voice**

Date: 01-27-2013	Document: <b>Version 1.2</b>
------------------	------------------------------

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB <sup>1</sup>	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Editor's Proposed Disposition on each comment submitted
					<p>the codec type is identified as Other (CDT=7), the final information item (comments/COM) shall be used to describe the codec.</p> <p><small>This is an optional field (container format/CFT) that gives information about the container for which encapsulates the audio data of the electronic file used to carry the voice data in recording. This field is not used if the voice recording is stored on a physical media object as signal. If present, this field overrides the CDC Field 11.012. This field does not accommodate Container Formats in a single Type-11 record. The Container Format shall be entered as the integer code from Table 3 below.</small></p> <p><small>Container files incorporate audio samples and specifications to properly decode the audio, a codec, and its parameters, e.g., number of channels, sample rate, bit/byte depth, and big/lit. More generally, the container formats can specify a codec, or simply encapsulate one or r channels as Linear PCM.</small></p> <p><small>The well-known Wave container specification has fields such as chunk ID, chunk size, audio form sampling rate, number of channels, space for extra parameters (for the codec or other uses).</small></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ <b>Sampling rate number (SRT):</b> indicates the number of digital samples per second that represent a second of analog voice data upon conversion to an acoustic signal. The sampling rate is expressed in Hz and must be an integer value. Acceptable values are between 1 and 100,000,000 Hz, but unknown or variable sampling rates shall be given the value of 0. Common values of SRT are 8000, 11025, 16000, 22050, 32000, 44100, and 48000 Hz. The value of 0 shall only be used to indicate unknown or variable sampling rate.</li> </ul>	

Please enter the date that you submit the comment in the Date box.

1 **MB** = Member identifier -- use something like NIST or ABC to designate your group

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

**NOTE** Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Add Rows as needed.

**Editor's Proposed Disposition of Comments on ANSI/NIST-ITL 1-2011  
Supplement 4 for Forensic Voice**

Date: 01-27-2013	Document: <b>Version 1.2</b>
------------------	------------------------------

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB <sup>1</sup>	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com- ment <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Editor's Proposed Disposition on each comment submitted
					<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ <b>Bit depth count (BIT):</b> indicates the number of bits that are used to represent a single digital sample of voice data. Acceptable values are between 1 and 64, inclusive. Encoders of unknown or variable bit depth shall be given the value of 0. (This field is not intended to be an indication of the actual dynamic range of the voice data.) Changes to the bit depth should be logged in Type-98 or <b>Field 11.902</b> audit logs. Common values for <b>BIT</b> are 8, 16, 24, and 32 bits.</li> <li>○ <b>Endian code (EDN):</b> indicates which byte goes first for digital samples containing two or more bytes. The values for <b>EDN</b> are 0=big, 1=little, or 2=native endian. (EDN is optional and ignored for digital samples that do not contain two or more integer multiples of bytes.)</li> <li>○ <b>Fixed point indicator (PNT):</b> indicates the digital sample representation. The value is 0 if the digital samples are represented as fixed-point or 1 if the samples are floating-point.</li> </ul>	

Please enter the date that you submit the comment in the Date box.

1 **MB** = Member identifier -- use something like NIST or ABC to designate your group

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

**NOTE** Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Add Rows as needed.



**Editor’s Proposed Disposition of Comments on ANSI/NIST-ITL 1-2011  
Supplement 4 for Forensic Voice**

Date: 01-27-2013	Document: <b>Version 1.2</b>
------------------	------------------------------

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB <sup>1</sup>	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com- ment <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Editor’s Proposed Disposition on each comment submitted
					<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ <b>Channel count (CHC)</b>: gives the integer number of channels of data represented in the digital voice data file. The number of channels must be between 1 and 99, inclusive. Common values for <b>CHC</b> are 1 and 2 channels.</li> <li>○ <b>Comments (COM)</b>: is an unrestricted text string of up to 4000 characters in length. It is required if the Codec Type is Other (<b>CDT</b>=7). For Codec Types other than Other, <b>COM</b> is optional and it can contain additional information about the codec or additional instructions for reconstruction of audio output from the stored digital data. Codec parameters shall be specified in this field when required for unambiguous decoding. This item should include a description of any noise reduction processing or equalization that must be applied to faithfully render the voice recording.</li> </ul>	
Nob 13	Field 11.010	Page 32, line 663	Te	Fourth item does not contain representation term or method of expressing information.	Rename item to “equalization description” and reword item to “The fourth information item (equalization description/EQ) is an optional text field containing up to 1000 characters and	<b>ACCEPT</b>

Please enter the date that you submit the comment in the Date box.

1 **MB** = Member identifier -- use something like NIST or ABC to designate your group

2 **Type of comment**: **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

**NOTE** Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Add Rows as needed.

**Editor's Proposed Disposition of Comments on ANSI/NIST-ITL 1-2011 Supplement 4 for Forensic Voice**

Date: 01-27-2013	Document: <b>Version 1.2</b>
------------------	------------------------------

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB <sup>1</sup>	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Editor's Proposed Disposition on each comment submitted
					indicating the the equalization that should be applied for faithful rendering of the voice recording on the physical media object.”	
Nob 14	Field 11.031	Page 40, line 1063	ed	For the sentence “the fourth information item (tagged date/TDT) is optional and gives the date tagged on the original...”, the meaning of ‘tagged’ is unclear.	Reword sentence to “The fourth information item (tagged date/TDT) is optional and gives the date indicated on the original...”	ACCEPT
Nob 15	Field 11.031	Page 40, line 1065	ed	In the fourth item description, previous acronym DOR is used for original recording date.	Change “DOR” to “ORD”	ACCEPT
Nob 5	Field 11.034	Page 44, line 1198	te	Field name needs to be updated from “Indicator” to “Identifiers”	Change bolded text to Vocal Collision Identifiers/VCI	ACCEPT
Nob 16a	Field 11.036	Page 45, line 1266	ge	Phonetic transcriptions could feasibly be used by an automated process in a different way than translations or semantic transcriptions could, and comments may be used differently than all three.	<p>Change Field 11.036 as follows:  Append to text of field description (1252): “At least one of the third, fourth, and fifth information items must be used if this field is used.”</p> <p>Change third item to: “The third information item (<b>semantic content text/SMC</b>) is an optional text field containing a translation or <b>semantic transcription</b> of the segment.”</p> <p>Add an item after the third: “The fourth information item (<b>phonetic transcript text/PTS</b>) is an optional text field containing a phonetic transcription of the segment.”</p> <p>Add an item after the fourth: “The fifth</p>	<p>ACCEPT Modify the following information items to reflect their proper numbering.</p> <p>Note that a turn may be comprised of several segments.  <b>Semantic and translation should be separate information items.</b></p>

Please enter the date that you submit the comment in the Date box.

1 **MB** = Member identifier -- use something like NIST or ABC to designate your group

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

**NOTE** Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Add Rows as needed.

**Editor’s Proposed Disposition of Comments on ANSI/NIST-ITL 1-2011  
Supplement 4 for Forensic Voice**

Date: 01-27-2013	Document: <b>Version 1.2</b>
------------------	------------------------------

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB <sup>1</sup>	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com- ment <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Editor’s Proposed Disposition on each comment submitted
					<p>information item (<b>segment content comments/COM</b>) is an optional text field containing comments on the content of the segment.</p> <p>Change current fourth item to: “The sixth information item (<b>transcript authority comment text/TAC</b>) is an optional text field and shall state the authority providing the transcription, translation or comments if SMC, PTS or COM is used. If an automated process was used to develop the transcript, information about the process (i.e., the automated algorithm used) should be included in this text.”</p>	
Nob 16b	Table 1, field 11.036	Page 23	ge	If 16a accepted, table will need to be filled in accordingly	<p>Adjust information items as follows: Change TRN to SMC, description to “semantic content text” Append an identical information item after SMC, replacing Mnemonic with “PTS” and Content Description with “phonetic transcript text” Append an identical information item after PTS, replacing Mnemonic with “COM” and Content Description with “segment content comments”</p>	EDITOR WILL UPDATE TABLE 1 accordingly
Nob 6	Field 11.037	Page 47, line 1323	te	In accordance with information item name change, remove reference to “intimacy”	Delete “/intimacy”	<b>REJECT</b>

Please enter the date that you submit the comment in the Date box.

1 **MB** = Member identifier -- use something like NIST or ABC to designate your group

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

**NOTE** Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Add Rows as needed.

**Editor's Proposed Disposition of Comments on ANSI/NIST-ITL 1-2011  
Supplement 4 for Forensic Voice**

Date: 01-27-2013	Document: <b>Version 1.2</b>
------------------	------------------------------

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB <sup>1</sup>	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Editor's Proposed Disposition on each comment submitted
Nob 7	Field 11.037	Page 47, line 1323	te	For the statement, "with 0 indicating no familiarity and 5 indicating high familiarity/intimacy", it is unclear whether the input value ranges from 0 to 5.	Reword statement to "which ranges from 0 indicating no familiarity to 5 indicating high familiarity"	ACCEPT
Nob 12	Table 6	Page 47	Te	Previous editor comment indicated that "Variable" would be added to Table 6, but it is not in the latest revision. Additionally, the line at 1333 should be changed to read "'If attribute codes '9' or '10' are chosen to indicate 'variable' or 'other', additional explanation may be included in the tenth information item (comments/COM) below."	Add "Variable" to Table 6 as item 9, change "Other" to item 10, and change line 1333 to read as indicated.	ACCEPT
Nob 8	Field 11.037	Page 47, line 1341	ed	Missing space	Add a space after "5"	ACCEPT
Nob 9	Table 8	Page 49	te	It is unclear what type(s) of microphone "Microphone" is to represent given that other types of microphones are explicitly noted.	TBD clarification is suggested	Noted
SJS U/3	11.038	1411	e	A distance is not a text	Remove the word "text" from the name of the item	Accept <b>Revise wording appropriately</b> ACCEPT
SJS U/4	11.038	1425	T	There is no provision for indication that an active noise cancelling was in place during data collection	Add an eighth information item and renumber subsequent items: The eighth information item ( <b>tnoise cancelation indicator/NCI</b> ) is an optional, binary value to indicate that an active noise cancelling system was used in the collection of the speech signal. 0 indicates no active noise cancelling. 1 indicates active noise cancelling.	Reject -- expand the Comments to say that any processing techniques to the the recording should be indicated, such as Automated Gain Control (AGC), noise reduction, etc.

Please enter the date that you submit the comment in the Date box.

1 **MB** = Member identifier -- use something like NIST or ABC to designate your group

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

**NOTE** Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Add Rows as needed.

**Editor's Proposed Disposition of Comments on ANSI/NIST-ITL 1-2011  
Supplement 4 for Forensic Voice**

Date: 01-27-2013	Document: <b>Version 1.2</b>
------------------	------------------------------

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
<b>MB<sup>1</sup></b>	<b>Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex</b> (e.g. 3.1)	<b>Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note</b> (e.g. Table 1)	<b>Type of com- ment<sup>2</sup></b>	<b>Comment (justification for change) by the MB</b>	<b>Proposed change by the MB</b>	<b>Editor's Proposed Disposition on each comment submitted</b>
SJS U/5	11.996	1504	T	Analog files cannot be digitally hashed	Change to This optional field shall contain the hash value of the data in <b>Field 11.999: Voice Data</b> of this record, calculated using SHA-256	This optional field applies to all digital audio records, whether stored in Field 11.999 or reference to an external storage location in Field 11.994.
						Add definition for INTERLOCUTOR
						Change the eighth information item from Alteration description to Voice Modification Description Text

Please enter the date that you submit the comment in the Date box.

1 **MB** = Member identifier -- use something like NIST or ABC to designate your group

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

**NOTE** Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Add Rows as needed.