

Commission on Enhancing National Cybersecurity

*Established by Executive Order 13718, Commission on
Enhancing National Cybersecurity*

Meeting Minutes

November 21, 2016

Public Call In: 1-888-323-9794

Attendees:

Please refer to the attendee listing attached to these minutes for the complete list of attendees.

Opening

Kiersten Todt, Executive Director, Commission on Enhancing National Cybersecurity

Ms. Todt opened the meeting at 9:07 a.m., Eastern Time.

Tom Donilon, Chair, Commission on Enhancing National Cybersecurity

Mr. Donilon welcomed the commission members and members of the public to the call. He noted public participation over the course of the commission's time has been a significant contribution to its work. The commissioners have also represented a broad range of expertise that has also contributed to the content and scope of the report. Kiersten and staff have also contributed.

Sam Palmisano, Vice Chair, Commission on Enhancing National Cybersecurity

Mr. Palmisano also thanked the commission publically for its work over the course of the time the commission has convened.

Approval of Minutes

The minutes from the public meeting held at the University of Minnesota in Minneapolis on August 23, 2016 were brought before the commission for approval. The motion was made and seconded to approve the minutes. The minutes were approved.

The minutes from the public meeting held at American University in Washington, D.C. on September 19, 2016 were brought before the commission for approval. The motion was made and seconded to approve the minutes. The minutes were approved.

September 20, 2016 Working Group Meeting Readout

Maggie Wilderotter, Commissioner, National Commission on Enhancing Cybersecurity

The September 20th meeting was the first of three work group meetings. It covered governance and discussions on transforming the government into a leader in cybersecurity, and clarifying specific responsibilities, action roles and authorities for the federal government; addressing capacity shortfalls in workforce, and elevating the importance of risk management for government.

Discussions on potential recommendations included an over-arching government strategy, finishing the National Cybersecurity Incident Response Plan (NCIRP); establishing a special assistant to the President focusing on cybersecurity; centralizing services for agencies; and cybersecurity for smaller agencies. It also focused on the internet of things; device security and safety and liability. It focused on education, including apprenticeships; the NICE presentation to Congress, working with younger children on raising awareness and interest in future careers. Critical infrastructure focused on America's aging infrastructure and additional topics. The commission will be reviewing topics for inclusion in the final report, and receiving additional feedback from the commission on appropriate areas to discuss further. There were no additional comments from the commissioners on the September 20th meeting.

October 19, 2016 Meeting Readout

Pat Gallagher, Commissioner, National Commission on Enhancing Cybersecurity

The October 19th meeting built on previously discussed topics and how to best present recommendations in the final report. Topics discussed included the internet of things, the convergence of the traditional internet and the internet of things, improved standards for privacy and security, harmonization of standards, a labeling system to provide transparency and a standard of care, the increasing use of botnets utilizing internet of things devices, and emerging standards of tort liability for internet of things devices.

Critical infrastructure topics included clarifying authorities and actions for public and private sector stakeholders, expanding use of the NIST framework across all sectors, and developing a public-private consortium in the first 100 days of the new administration to advise the President.

Discussion on the international aspects of cybersecurity included options to clarify application of international law to cybersecurity, the Mutual Legal Assistance Treaty (MLAT) process, and continued US thought leadership in cybersecurity and the internet.

Consumer awareness discussions included ways to raise consumer awareness, and a consumer bill of rights. Identity management discussions included discussions of an identity management clearing house, trusted identities, blockchain technologies, and a trusted identity ecosystem.

Insurance discussions included the topic of assisting the growing cyber insurance market with anonymous incident data sharing. Finally, the commission discussed how to group ideas into relevant buckets. There was also a process discussion on how to provide comments. There were no additional comments from the commissioners regarding the October 19th meeting.

November 8, 2016 Meeting Readout

Steve Chabinsky, Commissioner, National Commission on Enhancing Cybersecurity

The commission discussed the content and structure of the final report. It discussed possible imperatives, recommendations, and action items. The imperatives are intended to present key priorities, and discussed ordering them to provide the right message. The commission examined recommendations and action items within those imperatives, in order to convey specific steps to achieving key goals. Several major recommendations were discussed that required resolution by the commission. The commission discussed conflicts and challenges, including protecting the

digital economy, while also protecting the Nation. There was focus on recommending regulations and the relationship to market forces, and incentives to encourage market forces. Identity management was also discussed as well as reaching the goal of strong authentication. There is a technological and global convergence that threads throughout everything the commission is doing.

The commission examined federal government organization and discussed whether the Executive Office of the President, or the agencies themselves should have more control of cybersecurity at the agency level. Those governance issues were subject to some discussion. The commission looked at the right tools for securing the internet of things. Critical infrastructure was discussed in today's context and what it means in terms of convergence.

The idea of removing cybersecurity from end users, and movement toward common solutions was discussed, and the commission discussed the need to continue to educate and inform consumers. The next steps were for commissioners to review feedback, and update the final report. There were no additional comments on the November 8th meeting.

Deliberation

Mr. Chabinsky presented six imperatives for the commission to address in the report to the President:

- Better equip government to function effectively and securely in the digital age;
- Protect today's internet by better managing cyber risk in the public and private sectors;
- Shaping the internet of tomorrow through innovation;
- Preparing consumers to thrive in the digital age;
- Building cybersecurity workforce capabilities, and,
- Competing and functioning more effectively in the global economy.

Discussion

Key issues to address relating to the imperatives in the report:

- How to secure the digital economy;
- Ensure research and development aligns with future needs;
- What is the role of the consumer in contributing to security and resilience of the interconnected economy;
- Advance security considerations as connected devices are designed, manufactured, and deployed;
- Ensure the workforce is able to grow and evolve to keep up with requirements of the digital economy, and,
- Define the role of the US government and the private sector in international standard setting.

There was no additional input on the imperatives or key issues presented here. Mr. Chabinsky asked for a commission vote on the imperatives. Is there agreement on the six imperatives given here? There is agreement on these six, and the commission concluded the Federal Advisory Commission Act (FACA) requirements portion and proceeded to the public comment portion of the call.

Public Comment

David Leigh, Rofori Defcon Cyber

Mr. Leigh thanked the commission for its work. His company has a real time metric dashboard for cybersecurity that allows you to know where your organization stands at a moment's notice. Cybersecurity forms the foundation of trust. What will it take and when will improvement happen? It will happen when everyone measures what is actually being achieved in real time, then there will be trust. What outcome based metrics are being used? There have been no answers from government agencies to date. We need a holistic picture to bring high levels of security into a comprehensive whole. There must be an approach to measure what works. We have been collecting data about what doesn't work.

Charles Tupitza, Global Forum to Advance Cyber Resilience

Mr. Tupitza appreciated the mention of public and private collaboration. It is important collaboration continues. We are attempting to secure businesses and to make everyone better.

Mark Rockwell, Federal Computer Week

Mr. Rockwell requested the list of imperatives be repeated. Ms. Todt re-read the imperatives.

Shaun Waterman, Scoop News Group

Mr. Waterman requested details on the logistics of the final report delivery. The report will be delivered on December 1st. It is not currently known if the report will be made public on that day. The President has 45 days to comment. Ms. Todt offered to follow up when the information is available.

Blake Sobczak, E&E News

Mr. Sobczak requested an elaboration on steps for adopting incentives and the framework. What steps are being taken? Ms. Todt noted that the commission has been examining incentives and will be address them in the report. Mr. Alexander noted the commissioners felt in general that offering incentives, as opposed to regulation is the way to address problems.

Paul Merrion, CQ Roll Call

Mr. Merrion asked how large will the report be. Ms. Todt noted the report is still in formation and the language will be easily readable. The page count is an estimate, but should be 60-70 pages. The report will have big ideas, and actionable recommendations, some immediate and some longer term.

Closing

- Mr. Donilon noted the report will reflect the commission view on key principles. The goal is to present concrete actions to be taken.
- Report Availability: The commission will be working with the White House to determine when it can be released. Mr. Donilon would like to have the commissioners available to answer questions from the public and the media when the report is released. The report will be released in full following submission to the White House.
- Mr. Donilon and Ms. Todt both thanked the commission for its hard work.

The meeting adjourned at 9:44 a.m. Eastern Time.

List of Attendees

ATTENDEE LIST			
	COMMISSIONERS		
1	Keith	Alexander	
2	Annie	Anton	
3	Steven	Chabinsky	
4	Tom	Donilon	
5	Patrick	Gallagher	
6	Peter	Lee	
7	Herb	Lin	
8	Heather	Murren	
9	Sam	Palmisano	
10	Maggie	Wilderotter	
	EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR		
11	Kiersten	Todt	
	PARTICIPANTS		Company Name
12	Sara	Kerman	NIST
13	Sana	Ali	ITI
14	Stacey	Barrack	Internet Security Alliance
15	David	Batz	Edison Electric Institute
16	Mark	Boggis	Cyber Security Policy Solutions
17	Jon	Boyens	NIST
18	Missye	Brickell	US Senate Commerce Committee
19	Jamie	Brown	CA Technologies
20	Adam	Cohn	Splunk
21	Jennifer	Combs	Accenture
22	Kathryn	Condello	CenturyLink
23	Andrew	Crofton	Sprint
24	David	Dandar	The Mitre Corporation
25	Michael	DeCarlo	BlueCross BlueShield Assoc
26	Paul	Diamond	Century Link Telecommunications
27	Maureen	Fabbri	Eascorp
28	Alice	Falk	Commission Staff
29	Ashton	Garriott	MITRE Corporation
30	Angela	Gleason	American Insurance Assoc

	ATTENDEE LIST		
31	Judith	Hafner	Vantage Point Strategies
32	Tara	Hairston	Kaspersky Lab
33	Matthew	Hayduk	Federal Reserve Board
34	Matthew	Heyman	National Institute of Standards & Technology
35	Fred	Hintermister	NERC
36	Carl	Hoecker	Securities & Exchange Commission
37	Ira	Hunt	Accenture
38	Katie	Ignaszewski	IBM
39	Neil	Jenkins	DHS
40	Logen	Johnson	SAE International
41	Michael	Kans	Williams & Jensen LLC
42	Lee	Kim	HIMSS
43	Heather	King	Commission Staff
44	Robert	Knake	Orkestrel
45	Ryan	Lasalle	Accenture
46	Katherine	Ledesma	DHS
47	David	Leigh	Rofori Defcon Cyber
48	Jim	Linn	American Gas Assoc
49	Julie	Lucarelli	American Express
50	Amy	Mahn	Dept Of Homeland Security
51	Joseph	Marks	Nextgov (Media)
52	Robert	Mayer	US Telecomm
53	Melissa	Mejias	IADC
54	Chris	Merida	American Express
55	Paul	Merrion	CQ Roll Call (Media)
56	Daniel	Miller	Entergy
57	Sean	Morgan	Palo Alto Networks
58	Kevin	O'Brien	Accenture
59	Veronica	O'connell	Accenture
60	Chris	Olson	Media Trust
61	Anne	Palfrey	Deutsche Bank
62	Cherilyn	Pascoe	US Senate Commerce Committee
63	David	Perera	Internet Security Alliance
64	Matt	Piscitello	CRA
65	Suzanne	Potter	DHS
66	Kimberley	Raleigh	Commission Staff
67	Kyla	Reslock	ITAP
68	Kevin	Richards	Accenture
69	Mark	Rockwell	Federal Computer Week (Media)

	ATTENDEE LIST		
70	Diego	Rosero	Treasury Dept
71	Al	Saikali	Shook, Hardy, & Bacon
72	Andras	Scakal	IBM
73	Karen	Scarfone	Scarfone Cyber Security
74	Dianne	Smith	NCTA
75	Angela	Smith	GSA
76	Blake	Sobczak	E&E News (Media)
77	Dan	Taylor	AIG
78	Christian	Troncoso	BSA
79	Charles	Tupitza	Global Forum for Advance Cyber Resilience
80	Joe	Vines	Charter Communications
81	Shaun	Waterman	Scoop News Group (Media)
82	Rick	Weber	Inside Cyber Security (Media)
83	Chani	Wiggins	Twin Logic Strategies
84	Jon	Woodard	American Express
85	Shinichi	Yokohama	NTT
86	Wesley	Yurgaites	EOP Group
87	Jamie	Crooks	O'Melveny and Myers
88	JP	Chalpin	Commission Staff
89	Robin	Drake	Commission Staff
90	Mark	Barrett	Commission Staff