OSAC 2024-S-0006 Forensic Recognition and Documentation for Oral Healthcare Providers to Report Suspected Human Abuse

8	Forensic Odontology Subcommittee
9	Medicine Scientific Area Committee (SAC)
10	Organization of Scientific Area Committees (OSAC) for Forensic Science
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	Organization of Scientific Area Committees for Forensic Science
18	
19	



20	
21	DRAFT OSAC Proposed Standard
22	
23	OSAC 2024-S-0006
24	Forensic Recognition and
25	Documentation for Oral Healthcare
26	Providers to Report Suspected Human
27	Abuse
28	
29	Prepared by
30 31	Forensic Odontology Subcommittee Version: 1.0
32	June 2024
33	

34 **Disclaimer:**

35

This OSAC Proposed Standard was written by the Forensic Odontology Subcommittee of the Organization of Scientific Area Committees (OSAC) for Forensic Science following a process that includes an <u>open comment period</u>. This Proposed Standard will be submitted to a standard developing organization and is subject to change.

There may be references in an OSAC Proposed Standard to other publications under development by OSAC. The information in the Proposed Standard, and underlying concepts and methodologies, may be used by the forensic-science community before the completion of such companion publications.

Any identification of commercial equipment, instruments, or materials in the Proposed Standard is not a recommendation or endorsement by the U.S. Government and does not imply that the equipment, instruments, or materials are necessarily the best available for the purpose.

To be placed on the OSAC Registry, certain types of standards receive a Scientific and Technical Review (STR). The STR process is vital to OSAC's mission of generating and recognizing scientifically sound standards for producing and interpreting forensic science results. The STR shall provide critical and knowledgeable reviews of draft standards to ensure that the published



- 51 methods that practitioners employ are scientifically valid, and the resulting claims are 52 trustworthy.
- 53 The STR consists of an independent and diverse panel, which may include subject matter experts,
- 54 human factors scientists, quality assurance personnel, and legal experts as applicable. The
- selected group is tasked with evaluating the proposed standard based on a defined list of
- 56 scientific, administrative, and quality assurance based criteria.
- 57 For more information about this important process, please visit our website
- 58 at: <u>https://www.nist.gov/organization-scientific-area-committees-forensic-science/scientific-technical-</u>
- 59 <u>review-str-process</u>
- 60



61 Forensic Recognition and Documentation for Oral Healthcare Providers to Report Suspected 62 Human Abuse

63 RATIONALE

Licensed oral health care professionals and dental service providers are mandated reporters of 64 65 suspected abuse. This legal obligation applies to all 50 states, the District of Columbia, and all five 66 U.S. territories. It requires reporting any suspicion of abuse or negligence to the relevant authorities. However, due to the grave consequences of abuse and the potential impact of 67 improper reporting, practitioners and legal authorities need to be aware that this requirement 68 69 has both benefits and challenges in its implementation. Consequently, the American Dental 70 Association's Commission on Dental Accreditation and State Continuing Education have established longstanding educational and continuing requirements for oral health care 71 72 professionals on this subject. Clear documentation guidelines for oral health care professionals' 73 findings are essential. These guidelines protect victims and provide valuable guidance to 74 practitioners, law enforcement, and social services agencies regarding the conclusions 75 documented. By adhering to these standards, oral health care providers can fulfill their duty as 76 mandated reporters, contribute to safeguarding individuals from harm, and provide authorities 77 with accurate information to make a more definitive determination. 78

79 **1. SCOPE**

This standard establishes appropriate forensic documentation practices for oral healthcare professionals to fulfill their mandated reporting requirements and ensure the proper reporting of suspected signs of abuse to safeguard *vulnerable* individuals.

83

84 **2. NORMATIVE REFERENCES**

85 The document contains no normative references.

86

87 3. TERMS AND DEFINITIONS

- 88
- **3.1. Cognitive Bias** A deviation in human judgment caused by exposure to information irrelevant
 to the judgmental task 80 inappropriate for consideration. (OSAC Lexicon)
- 91

3.2. mandated reporter - an individual legally obligated to report suspected cases of abuse or
 neglect to the appropriate authorities.

94

3.3. neglect - failure to provide a safe and healthy environment by a caregiver, including nutrition,
 shelter, access to health care, protection from others, and maintaining an atmosphere of
 emotional support.

- 98
- 99 **3.4. abuse** deliberate harmful mistreatment of individuals on a singular or repeated basis.
- 100

101 **3.4.1. physical abuse -** any intentional act causing injury or trauma to another person.



- **3.4.2. psychological abuse** any intentional act that inflicts emotional or mental harm.
- 104

3.4.3. sexual abuse - any intentional act of imposing non-consensual and unwanted behaviors on an individual, encompassing actions that violate their physical and personal boundaries.

107

3.5. vulnerable - person or population group susceptible to physical or emotional harm, including
 adults and children who cannot advocate for themselves.

110

3.6. Reasonable suspicion - belief or perception based on objective facts and circumstances that
 would lead a prudent person to suspect the occurrence of a particular event or wrongdoing.

113

114 **4. TYPES OF ABUSE**

- 115 Abuse causes severe damage to individuals and can take different forms. It involves behaviors
- aimed at exerting control and dominance, resulting in physical, emotional, or psychological harm.
- 117 The types of abuse vary in complexity and manifestation, but all violate the rights and well-being
- of the abused individual. Understanding the types of abuse is vital for fulfilling the mandatory
- 119 reporting of suspected human abuse.
- 120

121 **4.1. Physical Abuse**

- 122 This type of abuse can be the most easily recognized by oral health care providers. Signs can 123 include unexplained injuries, bruises, burns, fractures, or multiple injuries in various stages of
- 123 include124 healing.
- 124

126 **4.2. Sexual Abuse**

127 Sexual abuse might not be outwardly recognized but can manifest as changes in behavior, 128 depression, anxiety, withdrawal, low self-esteem, or a lack of trust in others.

129

130 **4.3. Emotional/Psychological Abuse**

Both emotional abuse and psychological abuse can be harder to recognize. Still, they can also manifest as changes in behavior, depression, anxiety, withdrawal, low self-esteem, or a lack of trust in others.

134

135 **4.4. Neglect**

A passive form of abuse in which a perpetrator is responsible for, but fails to provide, adequate care for a victim. It can be physical or emotional. Physical *neglect* signs can include poor oral hygiene, untreated dental conditions, inadequate nutrition, or inappropriate clothing for weather conditions. Emotional neglect signs can include social isolation, lack of appropriate emotional support, or extreme changes in behavior.

141

142 **4.5. Financial Abuse**

- 143 This type of abuse cannot be readily obvious or recognized.
- 144
- 145



146 **4.6. Domestic Violence**

147 Oral health care providers should be attentive to signs of domestic violence, such as injuries that 148 appear to be the result of physical assault, frequent cancellations or rescheduling of 149 appointments, or verbal disclosures from patients.

150

151 **4.7.** Abuse of Vulnerable Adults (elder and dependent adults)

152 Signs of abuse can include unexplained injuries, malnutrition, dehydration, or unexplained 153 changes in behavior.

154

155 4.8 Human Trafficking

Oral health care providers should be attentive to signs of human trafficking, such as patients who 156 157 present accompanied by an individual (family member or not) who can or cannot be the 158 trafficker. They can be controlling, speaking for the patient, and answering questions on their 159 behalf. They can prevent the patient from speaking freely, insist on translating for them, or 160 monitor their interactions with others. The accompanying individual can refuse to be separated from the patient. They can also control the patient's identification documents (e.g., ID, passport) 161 162 and finances. Observed findings can include other signs of abuse, as previously stated, and can 163 also include marks, tattoos, or insignias that can represent "ownership" by another party. Patients will present with companions for various reasons, e.g., disability, age, and 164 language. However, a report should be made if there is suspicion of any abuse. 165

166

167 **5. LEGAL OBLIGATION**

As mandatory reporters, oral health care providers are legally obligated to report suspected or known cases of abuse or neglect to the appropriate authorities, even if the information is obtained in confidence or privileged circumstances. The types of abuse that typically fall under mandatory reporting requirements include *physical abuse*, sexual abuse, emotional abuse, neglect, human trafficking, and exploitation.

173

The specific criteria for what constitutes abuse, or just suspicion of abuse, varies by jurisdiction. Still, it generally involves intentional or negligent acts or omissions that cause harm or risk of harm to an individual. When encountering a situation that meets these criteria for abuse or neglect, the oral health care provider is obligated to make a report to the designated authorities, such as child protective services, adult protective services, or law enforcement agencies. Failure to fulfill mandatory reporting duties can result in legal consequences, including potential civil or

- 180 criminal penalties.
- 181

182 6. GENERAL PRINCIPLES

183

184 **6.1. Reasonable Suspicion**

185 Mandatory reporting typically requires a *reasonable suspicion* of abuse. This means that a dental 186 care professional must have a genuine belief, based on their professional judgment and 187 observations, that abuse or *neglect* has occurred, is occurring, or is likely to occur. The suspicion 188 should be based on objective indicators or evidence rather than mere speculation.

OSAC 2024-S-0006



190 6.2. Professional Judgment

191 Oral health care providers must rely on their professional expertise and training to recognize 192 signs of abuse or neglect. If, based on their professional judgment, they reasonably believe that a patient's injuries, behaviors, or circumstances indicate abuse or neglect, they can have a legal 193 obligation to report. Oral health care providers should be aware of and try to mitigate potential 194 195 cognitive biases that might affect the determination of a reasonable suspicion of abuse. Judgments should not be influenced by contextual factors such as race/ethnicity, socio-economic 196 status, likability of the patient or family, or any other factor not directly related to the task-197 198 relevant clinical findings. One approach to minimize the impact of these irrelevant factors is for 199 the provider to consider whether they would make the same determination if the contextual 200 factors of the case were different. Providers should also try to avoid confirmation bias by seeking 201 both confirming and disconfirming information for each hypothesis considered. It is also good practice to take a differential diagnosis approach and simultaneously consider several different 202 203 hypotheses, seeking both confirming and disconfirming evidence for each.

204

205 **6.3. Local Jurisdiction**

As a *mandated reporter* it is essential to be familiar with the specific laws and guidelines of the local jurisdiction. Each jurisdiction has its own requirements, reporting procedures, and designated authorities to whom the abuse should be reported. Familiarity with local regulations ensures compliance and effective intervention in cases of abuse, safeguarding the well-being of *vulnerable* individuals.

211

212 **6.4. Observable Indicators**

The suspicion of abuse should be based on observable indicators such as physical injuries, behavioral changes, or disclosure from the patient. These indicators should go beyond mere speculation or assumptions.

216

217 6.5. Legal Criteria

The jurisdiction's laws and regulations define the legal criteria for abuse and neglect. To ensure accurate identification and reporting, oral health care providers should familiarize themselves with the definitions of abuse and neglect as outlined in their specific jurisdiction.

221

222 In cases of uncertainty whether observations reach the threshold for reporting, it can be helpful to consult with colleagues, supervisors, or legal advisors who are knowledgeable about 223 224 mandatory reporting laws in your jurisdiction. If there are concerns about a potential abuse case, consider discussing it with knowledgeable colleagues or seeking a second opinion. 173 If you 225 226 have concerns about the accuracy or appropriateness of reporting, seek guidance from legal or 227 ethical experts who can advise based on your jurisdiction's specific regulations. This will allow for 228 additional perspectives, provide alternative diagnoses such as systemic diseases, and ensure a balanced assessment. 229

230

231 7. THRESHOLD FOR REPORTING

It is crucial to note that the legal threshold for reporting is often intentionally set low to prioritize
 the safety and well-being of at-risk individuals. In cases where the level of suspicion is not easily



quantifiable, oral health care providers are encouraged to consult with trained professionals unless there is suspicion of immediate danger. In addition, the determination of a reasonable threshold for suspicion of abuse under mandatory reporting rules can vary depending on the jurisdiction and the case's specific circumstances. It is essential to consult the guidelines and regulations set forth by the relevant authorities in your jurisdiction for specific guidance.

239

240 It is also important to clarify that oral health care providers are not responsible for investigating abuse or providing forensic examinations related to abuse cases. Their role as mandated 241 242 reporters focuses on recognizing and reporting suspicions of abuse based on their observations and professional judgment. Oral health care providers are not required to make 243 definitive determinations or gather extensive evidence. Instead, they should rely on their 244 245 training, experience, and objective observations to form a reasonable suspicion of abuse, triggering the obligation to report to the appropriate authorities. This approach ensures that oral 246 247 health care providers prioritize the safety and well-being of potential victims while leaving the investigative process to the relevant professionals in law enforcement and child protection 248 249 agencies.

250

251 **8. DOCUMENTATION**

Oral health care providers shall document specific observations and information that led them to suspect abuse or neglect is occurring or might be occurring. While the exact documentation requirements vary by jurisdiction, providing accurate and relevant information to the appropriate authorities is essential. Here are some general types of observations that an oral healthcare provider should consider documenting:

257

258 8.1. Identifying information

Provide the names, ages, and any known contact details of the individuals involved, including the suspected victim(s) and the alleged perpetrator(s). If the information is unavailable, provide descriptive details that could help identify the individuals.

262

263 8.2. Physical observations

Record any visible signs of injury, such as bruises, burns, cuts, or recent fractures. Note the location, size, shape, color, and any patterns of the injuries. Take clear and detailed photographs when appropriate and allowed.

267

268 8.3. Behavioral observations of the patient

- 269 Document any unusual or concerning behavior exhibited by the patient, such as fear, anxiety,
- 270 withdrawal, aggression, or changes in mood or personality. Record any statements made by the
- 271 patient that allude to abuse or mistreatment.
- 272

8.4. Behavioral observations of the caregiver/accompanying individual

274 Document any unusual or concerning behavior exhibited by the caregiver, such as speaking for

- the patient or answering questions on their behalf. They might prevent the patient from speaking
- 276 freely, insist on translating for them, or monitor their interactions with others. The accompanying
- individual may refuse to be separated from the patient.



278 8.5. Oral health observations

Note any dental conditions or oral health issues that could be indicative of neglect or abuse, such
as severe tooth decay, untreated infections, poor oral hygiene, or signs of malnutrition.
Document any irregularities or discrepancies in the patient's oral health history.

282

283 8.6. Photographic observations:

Photographs ensure the accuracy of evidence collection. This includes orientation photographs to demonstrate the correct anatomical location of the injury and close-up photographs to highlight the injury details. It is critical to photograph the wound with a ruler/scale (ex., ABFO Ruler #2) in place; preferably, both the ruler and injury are perpendicular to the camera lens to record injury metrics accurately. A periodontal probe or a coin may be used if a ruler/scale is not readily available.

290

291 **8.7. Radiological observations:**

Radiographs are an essential adjunct to the visual clinical examination and can accurately detect
 underlying abnormalities in oral-maxillofacial structures. Additionally, radiographs can serve as a
 historical record of previously healed injuries and prior surgical interventions.

295

296 8.8. Environmental observations

297 If the oral health care provider has concerns about the patient's living conditions, document any
298 observations that suggest unsafe or unsanitary living conditions, such as lack of adequate shelter,
299 cleanliness, or access to necessities.

300

301 8.9. Timelines

302 Maintain a record of dates, times, and locations of the observations, as well as any relevant 303 conversations or interactions with the patient or accompanying individuals.

304

305 **8.10. Witnesses**

306 Document the names and contact information of any witnesses present during the examination 307 or who might have relevant information about the patient's well-being or suspected abuse.

308

309 8.11. Medical history

310 Include any pertinent medical or dental history that might contribute to understanding the 311 patient's overall situation, including previous injuries or dental treatments.

312

313 8.12. Consent and refusal

- 314 Document any indications that the patient's caretaker might be preventing them from seeking 315 necessary dental care or treatment.
- 316 8.13. Relevant statements or disclosures
- 317 If the victim or witnesses have made any statements or disclosures related to the abuse, report
- these accurately, ensuring you note who said what and when it was said.
- 319
- 320



321 **8.14.** Any additional relevant information

Include any additional details pertinent to the case, such as prior incidents, concerns from other individuals, or any factors contributing to the risk of harm.

324

325 9. REPORTING GUIDELINES

When reporting an observation, the dental care provider shall not use terminology to make unsupported determinations. 248 Presenting the facts objectively and avoiding drawing definitive, unsupported conclusions is vital.

329

330 It is recommended that a modification of the Subjective Objective Assessment Plan (SOAP) note 331 be made, where a decision to make a referral takes place after the assessment. This will give the 332 appropriate agency guidance to initiate a more detailed investigation and formulate an 333 appropriate plan. Describe objective findings and include a differential diagnosis in the 334 assessment to help reduce biases. The following guidelines shall be used when reporting 335 observations.

336

337 9.1. Objective Reporting

- 338 Clearly state observations without adding personal opinions or assumptions. Focus on describing 339 specific behaviors or incidents that would raise concerns.
- 340

341 9.2. Unbiased Reporting

- 342 Use neutral and non-emotional language when describing observations. Avoid making judgments 343 or characterizations about a situation or the individuals involved.
- 344

10. Accurate, Comprehensive, and Detail Fact-Based Reporting

Provide specific details about the incident or behavior witnessed. Include relevant dates, times,
 locations, and any other pertinent information that can help authorities assess the situation
 accurately.

349

350 **10.1. Confidential Reporting**

351 Respect the privacy and confidentiality of the individuals involved. Only share relevant

352 information with the appropriate authorities or designated personnel responsible for handling

353 such reports.

354

355 **10.2. Seek Additional Insight**

If there are concerns about a potential abuse case, consider discussing it with knowledgeable colleagues or seeking a second opinion. If you have concerns about the accuracy or appropriateness of reporting, seek guidance from legal or ethical experts who can advise based on your jurisdiction's specific regulations. This will allow for additional perspectives, provide alternative diagnoses such as systemic diseases, and ensure a balanced assessment.

361



363 **10.3. Ongoing Education and training**

364 Stay updated on the latest research, guidelines, and training related to identifying and reporting

- 365 child abuse. Regularly participate in educational programs to enhance knowledge and skills in 366 this area.
- 367

368 **10.4. Comply With Reporting Protocols**

369 Be familiar with the reporting procedures established by professional organizations or the

- relevant authorities. Adhere to these protocols to ensure the report is submitted appropriately
 and timely.
- 372

373 **10.5. Prioritize Suspected Victim's Interest**

- 374 It is essential to acknowledge that the primary concern of mandatory reporting is the safety and
- well-being of the suspected abused victim. Ensure that actions taken are motivated by the
- intention to protect and support the individual rather than personal bias or assumptions. The
- 377 goal of the report is to provide an objective account of observations, allowing the authorities to
- 378 assess the situation based on the information provided.